**BOF Effectiveness Monitoring Committee Meeting Notes**

**October 28, 2020**

**GoToMeeting Webinar**

**1. Participants (19):**

Members--Sue Husari (Co-Chair), Loretta Moreno (Co-Chair), Sal Chinnici, Matt House, Dr. Leander Anderegg, Jim Burke, Bill Short, and Cliff Harvey

Staff—Matt Dias, Katie Harrell, Dave Fowler, and Pete Cafferata

Participants—George Gentry, Richard Gienger, Dr. Rob York, John Anderson, Tim Ryan, Bob Roth, and Andrew Lawhorn

**2. Report by the Co-Chairs**

a. **Introductions:** Katie Harrell was introduced as the new lead staff for the EMC, replacing Brandi Goss who left state service for graduate school at UC Davis.

b. **Monitoring News**:

-- Loretta Moreno announced that she, along with Keali’I Bright, DOC, provided a presentation to the BOF at their September meeting titled “*Update on AB 1492 Forest Ecosystem Monitoring and Assessment Initiative and related AB 2551 Spatial Analysis and Priority Planning*.” The recorded presentation is available at: [https://attendee.gotowebinar.com/recording/5707581762284570627](https://gcc02.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https%3A%2F%2Fattendee.gotowebinar.com%2Frecording%2F5707581762284570627&data=04%7C01%7CPete.Cafferata%40fire.ca.gov%7Cf6abbea91e544a30d68308d87cfbc897%7C447a4ca05405454dad68c98a520261f8%7C1%7C0%7C637396768121779064%7CUnknown%7CTWFpbGZsb3d8eyJWIjoiMC4wLjAwMDAiLCJQIjoiV2luMzIiLCJBTiI6Ik1haWwiLCJXVCI6Mn0%3D%7C1000&sdata=VUHCB7g8oHXkJ5P9Yf%2BzalV%2BoDrj8ahTLDKOBcyjbv8%3D&reserved=0) (start at 1 hour 55 minutes into the recording). They summarized the status of ecological performance measure (EPM) monitoring under AB 1492, and spatial assessment and restoration prioritization for the watersheds draining to Shasta, Oroville, and Trinity reservoirs, under the Headwaters Revitalization Imitative (AB 2551). The plan is to scale the AB 2551 work to statewide application, tying to AB 1492 objectives. An RFP for this work closed on September 25th, and the ~1 million dollar contract to develop a plan for forest and watershed restoration investments to improve watershed function and resilience in the area that supplies the three large reservoirs was awarded to UC Merced, with assistance from UC Berkeley, UC Davis, UCCE, and the Univ. of New Mexico. The team will help develop prioritization tools, and a stakeholder group will help guide the work.

-- Bill Short announced that CGS is putting a proposal together to conduct post-fire monitoring work, and that they will be looking for agency partners.

-- Pete Cafferata announced that the Boggs Mountain Demonstration State Forest (BMDSF) runoff and erosion study paper titled “Hillslope sediment production after wildfire and post-fire forest management in northern California” has been published by Hydrological Processes, and is available on request from ResearchGate: <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/344636940_Hillslope_sediment_production_after_wildfire_and_post-fire_forest_management_in_northern_California>

Detailed presentations on the BMDSF post-fire runoff and erosion studies will be provided at the December BOF meeting.

c. **EMC Grant Authorization:**

Sue Husari stated that up until now, the EMC has only awarded funding for projects through the state contracting process. This has limited the entities that can apply for funding and the time that the EMC has had to consider projects, as well as being a slow, challenging procedure. It was proposed that a grant process, in addition to contracting, would be highly beneficial for the EMC, allowing NGOs, private companies, quasi-private companies, etc. to apply for funding. Grant guidelines would have to be developed, more closely aligned with the critical questions and themes determined to be most important to the EMC. **Loretta Moreno made a motion to allocate staff time to investigate the grant process, and Sal Chinnici seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously. Sue Husari brought the motion to the full Board at their November meeting, and they approved it as well.**

d. **Other Updates:**

Sue Husari announced that EMC member Cliff Harvey, SWRCB, is retiring from state service on December 2nd. She thanked Cliff for his service on the EMC. No SWRCB staff have been selected to replace Cliff on the EMC at this time.

**3. Discussion of the BOF’s Draft Research Plan**

Matt Dias provided background information on the BOF research plan, stating that it is a biennial reporting process that was last updated in 2008. A small CAL FIRE and BOF cadre began work on a report outline and ranked potential research topics in August, submitting drafts on August 31st. Matt stated that Board members had concerns regarding the ranking process. The cadre is developing a shorter, condensed list of potential research topics that will provided as an online survey to a broad group of stakeholders in November, and EMC members will be involved in the ranking process. **If EMC members have comments on the draft report outline or original topic rankings, please provide them to Matt Dias or Pete Cafferata.** A draft research plan report will be developed by May 2021, with the final report finished by August. The goal is to have a succinct document that can act as a template for future plans.

**4. Discussion of Science to Policy Framework**

Loretta Moreno led a discussion on an adaptive management feedback loop for results learned from EMC funded projects, since no formal process has been articulated in previous EMC Strategic Plans. A draft diagram depicting a possible approach was presented at the April 2020 EMC meeting, and displayed again for this meeting. The goal is to have a well-documented (formalized) process for how to use EMC funded research findings. The various steps in the diagram were described and discussed; questions asked in the diagram include is the research scientifically sound?, is it scalable (applies to other areas in California)?, and if not, what are the next steps to follow.

EMC members agreed that the diagram is useful, providing transparency, but that a written narrative explaining the steps should be provided describing the various steps involved in the review process**.** It was agreed that when the additions are made and agreed to by the EMC, it should be added to the next version of the EMC Strategic Plan.

It was stated that this process requires the EMC to work closely with the project PIs to ensure that final products are meaningful to the EMC. Additionally, before a report with results would be sent to a Board committee, the EMC would conduct some level of analysis and develop potential recommendations, rather than sending the committee a raw report with data.

Possible scenarios for research findings include: (1) research validates the existing Forest Practice Rule(s) or other natural resource regulations, (2) red flag—possible need for rule change, (3) possible need for new category of regulations, and (4) research does not apply to the BOF’s rules (basic science). Research outcomes are to be related to one of these categories when sent to the Forest Practice Committee (or other Board committee).

**Action items for this agenda item include:**

* **Loretta Moreno will make modifications to the diagram.**
* **Loretta Moreno will provide a narrative for the various steps.**
* **EMC members are to provide input on the draft diagram by December 1st to Katie Harrell.**
* **When agreement is reached on the diagram and narrative, they are to be included in the Strategic Plan [Loretta Moreno to make changes].**

**5. Discussion of Existing EMC Research Underway and Oversight of Work**

A spreadsheet with the current EMC-funded projects was displayed for the group. Loretta Moreno and Sue Husari led a discussion on providing oversight for existing research projects to ensure that they deliver the products desired by the EMC. Currently BOF staff and CAL FIRE staff that are acting as contract administrators are serving in this role, checking in with the PIs on their progress and getting updates for the EMC, including updates for the annual report and workplan. The goal is to expand this task to EMC members, so that there is good communication with staff and the PI(s) on project status. This was described as being an “EMC Liaison.” This would not preclude having presentations on project progress at EMC meetings, as has been done in the past, and field trips to research sites. There was general support for the liaison concept from EMC members. Committee members are to suggest which projects they want to assist with.

The following EMC projects need liaisons, some of which already have volunteers:

| **Project No.** | **Subject** | **Principal Investigator** | **Possible EMC Liaison** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| EMC-2017-006 | |  | | --- | | Tradeoffs among riparian buffer zones | | Rob York | ? |
| EMC-2017-007 | |  | | --- | | Tree mortality in the Sierra Nevada | | John Battles | Loretta Moreno |
| EMC-2017-008 | |  | | --- | | CA FPRs and relation to fir mortality | | Richard Cobb | ? |
| EMC-2018-003 | |  | | --- | | Alternative Meadow Restoration | | Chris Surfleet | ? |
| EMC-2018-006 | |  | | --- | | Effect of FPRS on Class II Effectiveness for Canopy Closure, Water Temperature, & Primary Productivity | | Kevin Bladen, Catalina Segura, Matt House, and Drew Coe | Drew Coe |
| EMC-2019-002 | |  | | --- | | Fuel Treatment Longevity and Maintenance | | Feather River RCD | ? (possibly Stacy Drury) |
| EMC-2019-003 | |  | | --- | | Fuel Treatment Effects on Water Yield | | Terry Hogue and Alicia Kinoshita | Drew Coe and Pete Cafferata |
| EMC-2019-005 | |  | | --- | | LWD Impacts on Channel Morphology and Salmonid Habitat | | Cheryl Hayhurst | Bill Short |

**Action item for this agenda item:**

* **Project updates are to be provided to populate the 2020 annual report and workplan.**
* **Sue Husari and Katie Harrell will take the lead on updating the document. A draft document will be provided to the Board at their January 2021 meeting.**
* **Katie Harrell is to send a group email message with the table above to solicit additional EMC liaisons. Feedback from the EMC is to be provided by December 1st.**

**6. Discussion of Potential Priority Themes for the 2021 Request for Proposals**

The EMC discussed priority themes for the 2021 request for proposals, and the concept of conducting a literature review on topics that are aligned with BOF priorities. The goal is to have the EMC remain relevant and useful to the BOF during this period without new funding. A matrix was provided to the EMC to help reveal where BOF priorities align with EMC critical questions/themes. This work will be useful for selecting new project proposals in 2021 during the next funding cycle. Simply stated, the EMC wants to know what topics need additional research?

**Sue Husari stated that this is a homework assignment for EMC members. Each member is to send an email message to Katie Harrell stating which critical questions need to be addressed during the next funding cycle, selecting the two to three highest priorities. When the highest ranked critical questions are selected, the EMC will conduct a background literature review on the topics.**

**Responses on all assignments are due by December1, 2020 to Katie Harrell.**

**7. Public Forum** – None.

**8. Discussion of Future Meeting Locations, Dates, and Agenda Items**

The next meeting will be held online during the week of January 11th, 2021. Katie Harrell will send out a Doodle poll for the exact meeting date.

**9. Announcements: Scientific Conferences, Symposiums, and Workshops**

* The California Forest Pest Council meeting will be held online November 18-19, 2020, with no cost. See: <http://caforestpestcouncil.org/2020/06/69th-california-forest-pest-council-annual-meeting-online-save-the-date/>
* The American Geophysical Union (AGU) meeting will be held online this year. The meeting will be over 17 days (December 1-17, 2020). For more information, see: <https://www.agu.org/Fall-Meeting/Pages/Register-Housing/Registration-Rates>
* The George Wright Society Fire Management 24/7/365 Workshop scheduled for October has been rescheduled for February 11-12, 2021, using an in-person/virtual hybrid format. This is a training workshop on the mitigation of wildfire risk in mixed conifer forests of California. See: <https://www.georgewrightsociety.org/fire>