EFFECTIVENESS MONITORING COMMITTEE

P.O. Box 944246

SACRAMENTO, CA 94244-2460

Website: www.bof.fire.ca.gov

(916) 653-8007

Effectiveness Monitoring Committee (EMC)

Meeting Notes

Meeting Date and Time: Wednesday, June 7, 2023 9:30 AM

Virtual Meeting

This EMC Meeting was only hosted via teleconference, as authorized pursuant to Government Code Section 11133.

A recording of the meeting may be viewed by filling out the registration form here: **https://attendee.gotowebinar.com/recording/6643287070073779712**

Times before each agenda item are approximate and align with the timer in the video recording.

1) **Call to Order, Hybrid Meeting Format, Roll Call, and Core Values – Edith Hannigan, *Executive Officer***

   Edith Hannigan called the meeting to order, reviewed the hybrid meeting format and methods for interacting with the committee, and called the roll:

   Participants (17)

   Members Present (12) – Dr. Elizabeth Forsburg-Pardi (Co-Chair), Bill Short, Jim Burke, Jessica Leonard, Loretta Moreno (Co-Chair), Jonathan Meurer, Dr. Matt O'Connor, Dr. Michael Jones, Mathew Nannizzi, Clarence Hostler, Sal Chinnici, and Dr. Leander Love-Anderegg

   Members Absent (4) – Dr. Stacy Drury, Ben Waitman, Drew Cow, Dr. Peter Freer-Smith

   Staff (3) – Aaron Rachels, Andrew Lawhorn, Edith Hannigan

   Audience Participants (2) – Roberta Lim, Alexandra Rosado

   A quorum was present.

   Time: 09:30

2) **Report by the Co-Chairs – Lorretta Moreno and Dr. Elizabeth Forsburg-Pardi**

   A. Membership Updates

   There are up to 8 open seats on the EMC. Details on the open seats are available here:

   EMC Members Open-Pending Open Seats (ca.gov)

   - Co-Chair Loretta Moreno will be stepping down from the EMC at the conclusion of this meeting.
   - Clesi Bennett has been nominated as Co-chair Moreno's replacement representing the California Natural Resources Agency (CNRA) on the EMC, and her nomination will be reviewed later in this meeting.

EFFECTIVENESS MONITORING COMMITTEE
P.O. Box 944246
SACRAMENTO, CA 94244-2460
Website: www.bof.fire.ca.gov
(916) 653-8007

- Member Drew Coe has been nominated as Co-Chair Moreno's replacement.
- Member Jessica Leonard will continue to fill the State Water Resources Control Board role until an appropriate replacement is found.
- Member Dr. Stacy Drury will vacate the USFS seat on the EMC once an appropriate replacement is found.
- Member O'Connor inquired if there was a desired background for the open seat in the Monitoring Community. Co-Chair Moreno indicated that no specific background was desired.
- The following member terms are scheduled to expire in the near future:
  - Member Dr. O'Connor (indicated he was undecided on his return).
  - Member Dr. Love-Anderegg (indicated that he would like to continue on the EMC).
  - Member Dr. Peter Freer-Smith (was absent; Dr. Wolf will follow up to determine his interest in continuing).
- Aaron Rachels and Dave Fowler from the Regional Water Boards have agreed to provide the EMC with support as project liaisons and notetakers.

B. Full Project Proposal Funding Updates

Co-chair Elizabeth Forsburg-Pardi reviewed the Budget Projections Balance for 2023-24 and 2025-26; detailed information on these projections can be found here:

EMC Budget Projections 2023-24 to 25-26 (ca.gov)

Matthew O'Connor asked if any of the proposed project grants could move their allocated funds to 2023-2024 to address the surplus $50,379. Co-Chair Moreno indicated that those discussions have not happened yet.

The EMC received four applications for research funding.

Time: 10:00

3) Project Updates

Co-chair Moreno indicated that she would continue working with Dr. Michael Jones and John Battles on EMC 2017-007 after she steps down. A completed research assessment is expected in 2023.

No additional project updates were received.

4) Review EMC Member Application(s); Appointment of EMC member(s) and Co-Chair

A. Motion to approve Clesi Bennett as Loretta Moreno's replacement as the CNRA representative.

- Member Short: aye
- Member Burke: aye
- Member Jones: aye

EFFECTIVENESS MONITORING COMMITTEE
P.O. Box 944246
SACRAMENTO, CA 94244-2460
Website: www.bof.fire.ca.gov
(916) 653-8007

- Member Nannizzi: aye
- Member Chinnici: aye
- Member O'Connor: aye
- Member Love-Anderegg: aye
- Member Meurer: aye
- Member Leonard: aye
- Co-Chair Moreno: aye
- Co-Chair Foresburg-Pardi aye

Motion passes; EMC will recommend to the Board to appoint Clesi Bennett to the EMC.

B. Motion to approve Drew Coe as Loretta Moreno's replacement as EMC Co-Chair.

- Member Short: aye
- Member Burke: aye
- Member Jones: aye
- Member Nannizzi: aye
- Member Chinnici: aye
- Member O'Connor: aye
- Member Love-Anderegg: aye
- Member Meurer: aye
- Member Leonard: aye
- Co-Chair Moreno: aye
- Co-Chair Foresburg-Pardi aye

Motion passes; EMC will recommend Drew Coe as EMC Co-Chair to the Board.

5. Review of 2023/24 Initial Concept Proposals

Edith Hannigan noted that on May 26, EMC members received four initial concept proposals to review. She outlined that at today's meeting, EMC members would have the opportunity to ask additional questions and indicate if they would like to see full research proposals. She reviewed grant guidelines with the group and reviewed the EMC's funds available through 2026. These budget projections can be viewed here:

EMC Budget Projections 2023-24 to 25-26 (ca.gov)

Member Hostler asked if the EMC would lose any funds that it did not spend and was told yes; 'use it or lose it.'

EFFECTIVENESS MONITORING COMMITTEE
P.O. Box 944246
SACRAMENTO, CA 94244-2460
Website: www.bof.fire.ca.gov
(916) 653-8007

Edith Hannigan outlined that F=full project proposals are due July 5th. In August, EMC members will rank the projects and recommend which ones to fund. Applicants will be notified on August 23rd and funds dispersed later in the fall.

EMC members engaged in the following discussions for each of the four project proposals. Sal Chinnici recused himself from all discussions and voting as he is a collaborator on one of the proposals.

EMC-2023-001 (ca.gov)

- Member Love-Anderegg was supportive of this proposal. He asked how restrictive the current FPRs are regarding seed sourcing.
- Member O'Connor was generally supportive of this proposal and had no specific comments.
- Member Nannizzi was also generally supportive of the proposal but had a concern that is was a little 'climate-heavy.' He was supportive of additional seed bench investigation.
- Member Jones thought the proposal was well thought out academically but would like to see a more detailed budget breakdown (for example, more specifics on the $100,000 for field labor). He fails to see how the project fits with the EMC's goal of improving the FPRs and adaptive management. He also indicated that the timing of the project might be a little short to see meaningful results.
- Member Short also expressed concern regarding the direct ties between this project and the FPRs. He also asked how applicable findings from the Angeles National Forest would be to other parts of the state where there are more productive timberlands. However, he was supportive of the proposal.
- Member Hostler had no comments.
- Member Meurer was supportive of the proposal and would be interested in seeing additional commercial species addressed (though recognized that that was likely beyond the scope of this project).
- Member Leonard was supportive of seeing a full proposal.
- Member O'Connor asked if anyone was able to give a primer on how the FPRs and the results of this study could affect management of oak woodlands.
    - Member Jones outlined the difference between Group A (more commercially desirable) and Group B (typically what oaks are classified as) under the FPRs. He noted that oaks are regulated under the FPRs when they co-exist with Group A species but does not think this proposal fully teases out the degree to which its findings could affect the FPRs. In response to Member Short's questions, Member Jones indicate that the species relevant to this study occur throughout California, meaning that the findings of this study would likely be more broadly applicable.
- Member Moreno was generally supportive of this project and thought it addresses a gap in our knowledge. She agreed more work was needed on the adaptive management nexus and questioned whether the timeline was long enough to collect meaningful results.

EFFECTIVENESS MONITORING COMMITTEE
P.O. Box 944246
SACRAMENTO, CA 94244-2460
Website: www.bof.fire.ca.gov
(916) 653-8007

- Member Jones indicated that he would like to see the seed selection ensemble provided as this could help support why the chosen sites were selected.

EMC-2023-002 (ca.gov)

- Member O'Connor wanted to know about eligibility requirements: can a private company submit a proposal? The answer was yes, private companies are eligible. O'Connor indicated that he would hope the company would work hard at collaborating with local land managers. Co-Chair Moreno indicated that she believed that the PI has a long-standing relationship with the local RCD. Member O'Connor was supportive of the proposal otherwise.
- Member Nannizzi thought this was a great project and would appreciate having more 'tools in the toolbox' to effectively manage these riparian areas.
- Member Jones asked if they were allowed to suggest the addition of PIs to the project not affiliated with the company. Edith Hannigan said that she would talk to Kristina Wolf about this issue.
- Member Short liked the project and questioned whether all their objectives were achievable with such a low amount of money requested.
- Member Hostler was generally supportive.
- Member Meurer was supportive of the project and would like to see focus on the variety of management practices within WLPZs and their resultant impacts.
- Member Leonard would like to see more of a tie-in to the FPRs but noted that it is a low-cost study so is interested in seeing the full proposal.
- Member O'Connor suggested that the project could increase their overall field work and cost on the front end of the project to address the 2023 EMC surplus.
- Co-Chair Moreno thought there was substantial work to be done if this project were to move to a full proposal. She was concerned with what aspects of the FPRs were being tested and what adaptive management implications were being addressed. She thought that the low project budget was suitable given the amount of work the project was addressing through GIS (and thought that the field work needed to be linked to the GIS work more clearly). She also indicated that documenting past WLPZ conditions in addition to present ones could benefit the project and questioned what broader conclusions could actually be drawn from flying a UAV.
- Co-Chair Forsburg-Pardi noted that similar issues were currently being discussed in the Forest Practice Committee, so this research could be timely. She suggested moving forward to a full proposal.

EMC-2023-003 (ca.gov)

- Member Love-Anderegg liked the project's clear tie-in with the FPRs and thought the study was scientifically straightforward.

EFFECTIVENESS MONITORING COMMITTEE
P.O. Box 944246
SACRAMENTO, CA 94244-2460
Website: www.bof.fire.ca.gov
(916) 653-8007

- Member O'Connor was generally supportive and thought this proposal could serve as a good example to others on how to connect their research with the FPRs.
- Member Nannizzi would like to see the full proposal.
- Member Jones would like to see the full proposal.
- Member Short was supportive of the study and appreciated that it was focused in a coastal area.
- Member Hostler was very supportive of the proposal.
- Member Meurer was fully supportive of the proposal.
- Member Leonard thought the concept proposal was clear and straightforward; she was supportive of seeing a full proposal.
- Co-Chair Moreno would like to see a bit more detail in the full proposal regarding the scope of the project; she noted that several questions were embedded in the text, but it wasn't clear which ones would exactly be addressed. Her questions also included (i) whether the timeline of the study was long enough to see a meaningful response, (ii) if pre-treatment data would be collection in addition to post-treatment, and (iii) what tools would be used for risk assessment.
- Co-Chair Forsburg-Pardi was supportive of seeing a full proposal.

EMC-2023-004 (ca.gov)

- Member Love-Anderegg thought it was difficult to see how this project would inform the FPRs, but noted it was an interesting study scientifically.
- Member O'Connor agreed that connectivity to the FPRs needed work; and asked for more information on why the dusky-footed woodrat was a useful indicator for ecosystem health
- Member Nannizzi echoed the same concerns.
- Member Jones noted it would useful if data were included about the treatments being used (what tree species were being removed). He would like to see a full proposal and thought it could address the effectiveness of different fuel management treatments.
- Member Short was also concerned about the proposal's relevance to the FPRs and also questioned whether findings from this research could be able to other geographic areas
- Member Hostler agreed with all the previous comments.
- Member Meurer would like to see a clear link between the health of the woodrats with management practices.
- Member Leonard was supportive of receiving a full proposal.
- Co-Chair Moreno was also supportive of recommending receipt of a full proposal but does not know how the study will effectively address cumulative effects.
- C-Chair Forsburg-Pardi was supportive of receiving a full proposal for this project.

EFFECTIVENESS MONITORING COMMITTEE
P.O. Box 944246
SACRAMENTO, CA 94244-2460
Website: www.bof.fire.ca.gov
(916) 653-8007

- Member Short would like more information in the form of maps and forest types in the full proposal; Co-Chair Moreno expanded on this by indicating that mention of surrounding land use would be helpful.
- Member Love-Anderegg noted that Jasper Ridge is Stanford's research reserve, meaning that several surrounding ground cover types are present.

Edith Hannigan asked if anyone wanted to revisit any of the proposals. Nobody said yes.

Voting Record: Motion to request a full project proposal from EMC-2023-001.

Motion: Member Coe
Second: Member Moreno

- Member Leonard aye
- Member Meurer aye
- Member Hostler nay
- Member Short aye (qualified, wants to see his concerns addressed)
- Member Jones aye
- Member Nannizzi aye
- Member O'Connor aye
- Member Love-Anderegg aye
- Co-Chair Forsburg-Pardi aye
- Co-Chair Moreno aye

Voting Record: Motion to request a full project proposal from EMC-2023-002.

Motion: Member O'Connor
Second: Member Nannizzi

- Member Leonard aye
- Member Meurer aye
- Member Hostler aye
- Member Short aye
- Member Jones aye
- Member Nannizzi aye
- Member O'Connor aye
- Member Love-Anderegg aye
- Co-Chair Forsburg-Pardi aye
- Co-Chair Moreno nay

EFFECTIVENESS MONITORING COMMITTEE
P.O. Box 944246
SACRAMENTO, CA 94244-2460
Website: www.bof.fire.ca.gov
(916) 653-8007

Voting Record: Motion to request a full project proposal from EMC-2023-003.

Motion: Member O'Connor
Second: Member Hostler

- Member Leonard aye
- Member Meurer aye
- Member Hostler aye
- Member Short aye
- Member Jones aye
- Member Nannizzi aye
- Member O'Connor aye
- Member Love-Anderegg aye
- Co-Chair Forsburg-Pardi aye
- Co-Chair Moreno aye

Voting Record: Motion to request a full project proposal from EMC-2023-004.

Motion: Member O'Connor
Second: Member Anderegg

- Member Leonard aye
- Member Meurer aye
- Member Hostler aye
- Member Short aye
- Member Jones aye
- Member Nannizzi aye
- Member O'Connor aye
- Member Love-Anderegg aye
- Co-Chair Forsburg-Pardi aye
- Co-Chair Moreno aye

Full proposals will be requested from all four initial concepts.

6. Public Forum

Nobody requested to speak.

7. Future Meeting Locations, Dates, and Agenda Items

Edith Hannigan noted the next EMC Meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, August 2nd.

EFFECTIVENESS MONITORING COMMITTEE
P.O. Box 944246
SACRAMENTO, CA 94244-2460
Website: www.bof.fire.ca.gov
(916) 653-8007

Starting July 1st, committee members must be in a space accessible to the public if they are not at the meeting in-person. This accessible location must be noticed on the agenda, so Kristina Wolf needs to be notified with that location at least two weeks in advance. Agendas must be posted at any location from which an EMC member is attending the meeting. Edith Hannigan strongly encouraged EMC members to attend in person.

8. Announcements

Co-Chair Moreno made an announcement regarding a statewide monitoring system for climate resilience; she indicated the EMC would be notified with future developments.

Member Jones announced that net week is the Casper Watershed Annual Meeting; the first day of the meeting will be virtual and present the research, while the second day will consist of in-person visits to the sites. He also indicated that 2019–2021 post-fire workshops would continue to be accessible on the UC Forest Research and education website.

Meeting adjourned.